



IN REPLY REFER TO:

S72(HFC-___)

December 17, 2004

United States Department of the Interior

NATIONAL PARK SERVICE
Harpers Ferry Center
P.O. Box 50
Harpers Ferry, West Virginia 25425-0050

ATTACHMENT D

Memorandum

To: Contracting Officer, Harpers Ferry Center

From: Technical Evaluation Panel Members, Harpers Ferry Center

Subject: Technical Evaluation of Proposals under Request for Proposal Number _____, (Project Title) _____

On September 16, 2004, the technical evaluation panel met to evaluate the ___ proposals submitted in response to Solicitation Number _____, for the _____ for _____. The technical evaluation panel was conducted and monitored by JoAnne Grove, Contracting Officer and Sheila Spring, Contract Specialist, Office of Acquisition Management. The panel consisted of the following individuals:

- Zack Johnson, Department of Conservation, Media Assets
- Mary Jones, Site Manager, Harpers Ferry National Historical Park
- Cliff Smith, Curator, Harpers Ferry National Historical Park

Zack Johnson served as the panel Chairperson.

No information revealed that any panel member has an actual or potential organizational conflict of interest. Each panel member read and signed a Confidentiality Certificate agreeing not to disclose any proposal information. Each panel member also signed a Conflict of Interest Certificate certifying that they are free from actual or potential conflicts of interest.

The technical evaluation panel found two proposals acceptable and one proposal unacceptable. Offerors ABC Company and LMN Company were found to be acceptable and technically equal. Each clearly demonstrated their ability to accomplish the work set forth in the Request for Proposal (RFP). Offeror XYZ Company was found to be unacceptable. The major deficiency in this proposal was _____.

Attached is the panel's evaluation of the proposals as well as a recap of their individual scores and their score sheets. Based on this evaluation, the panel unanimously recommends that the top two proposals be included in the competitive range.

Attachments

SIGNATURE PAGE

Zack Johnson, Chief Conservator
Department of Conservation, Media Assets

Date

Mary Jones, Site Manager
Harpers Ferry National Historical Park

Date

Cliff Smith, Curator
Harpers Ferry National Historical Park

Date

ABC Company
ACCEPTABLE

TOTAL SCORE: 93.79

A. PAST PERFORMANCE
(MAXIMUM SCORE 40 POINTS)

AVERAGE SCORE: 38.79

*To be added by the Office of Acquisition Management

Quality of Products and Services

Customer Satisfaction

Cost Control

Timeliness of Performance

Business Relations

B. **PERSONNEL AND RELEVANT**
(MAXIMUM SCORE 35 POINTS)

AVERAGE SCORE: 33.00

CRITERIA: Evaluation will be based on education, training, and relevant experience of the personnel proposed for use under this contract. Knowledge of historic and contemporary image research, ordering, and acquisition will also be evaluated.

STRENGTHS

ABC Company has experience with imaging and document management, conducting research using the internet, various reference materials and archival images, as well as negotiating use rights and purchasing royalty free graphics. The firm has proven performance and hands-on experience in the areas of graphics research, copyright law, intellectual property rights, acquisition, and negotiation skills. The agency offers multiple talents and contacts.

WEAKNESSES

No mention of working with historic or contemporary photography.

C. **RELEVANT COMPUTER AND**
SOFTWARE EXPERIENCE
(MAXIMUM SCORE 25 POINTS)

AVERAGE SCORE: 22.00

CRITERIA: Evaluation will be based on training and relevant experience with computers and software.

STRENGTHS

ABC Company elaborates on their personnel's computer experience. They make reference to researching and ordering graphics from a variety of media, including Internet search engines, image archives and libraries, museum and government archives, and any other available resources pertinent to the search. Experience with Windows 98, XP, NT, 2000, Word Perfect, JPEG, Photoshop, and TIFF.

WEAKNESSES

None

LMN Company
ACCEPTABLE

TOTAL SCORE: 91.75

A. PAST PERFORMANCE
(MAXIMUM SCORE 40 POINTS)

AVERAGE SCORE: 37.29

*To be added by the Office of Acquisition Management

Quality of Products and Services

Customer Satisfaction

Cost Control

Timeliness of Performance

Business Relations

B. **PERSONNEL AND RELEVANT**
(MAXIMUM SCORE 35 POINTS)

AVERAGE SCORE: 32.00

CRITERIA: Evaluation will be based on education, training, and relevant experience of the personnel proposed for use under this contract. Knowledge of historic and contemporary image research, ordering, and acquisition will also be evaluated.

STRENGTHS

All strengths were described in the first paragraph of the qualification criteria. LMN Company researches and procures photographs and illustrations for design work. Expert experience in each of the nine tasks outlined – whether using the Internet, reference materials or archival images, LMN works with designers, writers, editors, and client personnel to research and secure images. Images procured within 4 weeks. LMN follows-up on orders and obtains permission to use all images. Labels images and stores data into an accountable database. Negotiates each image's use rights.

LMN Company has worked to secure photos of the earth from NASA and historical photos of John F. Kennedy from the National Archives.

WEAKNESSES

None

C. **RELEVANT COMPUTER AND**
SOFTWARE EXPERIENCE
(MAXIMUM SCORE 25 POINTS)

AVERAGE SCORE: 22.46

CRITERIA: Evaluation will be based on training and relevant experience with computers and software.

STRENGTHS

LMN Company personnel possess expert abilities in using search engines (such as, but not limited to, Google, MSN, Yahoo, etc.) the Internet, and Microsoft Office software (including Microsoft Word). They use a variety of design and office software including, Microsoft Office Professional 2000 (including Word 2000) and Adobe PhotoShop 7 for the PC and Macintosh. Mr. Rose has 10 years experience with Adobe PhotoShop. Rose Design computers are networked and operate on a redundant T1 connection.

WEAKNESSES

None

XYZ Company
UNACCEPTABLE

TOTAL SCORE: 15.00

B. PERSONNEL AND RELEVANT
(MAXIMUM SCORE 35 POINTS)

AVERAGE SCORE: 10.00

CRITERIA: Evaluation will be based on education, training, and relevant experience of the personnel proposed for use under this contract. Knowledge of historic and contemporary image research, ordering, and acquisition will also be evaluated.

STRENGTHS

XYZ Company makes reference to conducting research, using various reference materials and archival materials, negotiating use rights, and purchasing royalty free images. They refer to image acquisition and archiving, and they describe copyright law and intellectual property rights and negotiation skills.

WEAKNESSES

XYZ Company doesn't describe work with historic images; instead they make reference to working with historical documents. The key personnel was not designated. There were no personnel resumes. The proposal reflects services beyond those required for this project. They only mention two staff members.

C. RELEVANT COMPUTER AND
SOFTWARE EXPERIENCE
(MAXIMUM SCORE 25 POINTS)

AVERAGE SCORE: 5.00

CRITERIA: Evaluation will be based on training and relevant experience with computers and software.

STRENGTHS

None

WEAKNESSES

XYZ Company did not elaborate on their computer skills, experience or provide information on any software programs they use. They make reference to researching and ordering graphics from a variety of media, but did not elaborate on how they research or acquire the graphics.